# Submissions considered by the Board on 2 December 2022 for proposals to assign Paerātā Railway Station, Ngākōroa Railway Station and Drury Railway Station [new names]



#### Summary

At its hui on 26 July 2022 the Board declined three proposals from KiwiRail and Auckland Transport (AT) for Paeraataa Railway Station, Ngaakooroa Railway Station, and Te Maketuu Railway Station. Instead, the Board proposed:

- Paerātā Railway Station
- Ngākōroa Railway Station
- Drury Railway Station

based on standardising the orthography and Drury Railway Station being more appropriate than the proposed Te Maketuu Railway Station due to its location serving the existing Drury township.

During the notification period from 9 August 2022 to 9 November 2022 the Board received 112 submissions from 70 submitters:

Proposed name	Supporting	Objecting	Neutral/unclear
Drury Railway Station	59	4	1
Ngākōroa Railway Station	5	22	1
Paerātā Railway Station	14	5	1

The proposals attracted local interest with 63 of the 70 submitters identified themselves as living in Auckland: 38 being from around Pukekohe to Papakura.

While the number of submissions is relatively low, there was notable support for Drury Railway Station. Submitters agreed with the Board's rationale, emphasising a logical connection of the railway station name to the place it serves, and conversely that the original proposal for Te Maketuu Railway Station was too distant from the associated place names it would be connected with.

The themes in the submissions are summarised under the 'Submissions' heading below with comments from the Secretariat for some. The main reasons given in the submissions are:

Proposed name	Main reasons
Drury Railway Station	Support based on the name being appropriately connected to the populated place.
Ngākōroa Railway Station	Ngākōroa inappropriate, poor connection to the railway station, even locals weren't aware of the name of the creek. Various alternative names proposed instead, mainly for Runciman Railway Station.
Paerātā Railway Station	Support based on the name being appropriately connected to the populated place.

KiwiRail and AT made a joint objecting submission re-proposing the originally proposed names (with double vowels) that had been declined by the Board. Waka Kotahi and Grimshaw (an architectural firm designing the railway stations) made similar objecting submissions. The Board has already considered most of those reasons at its 26 July 2022 hui. No further objecting submissions in favour of the names with long vowels were received from the general public and there were a small number of submissions supporting the standardised orthography (ie macrons). KiwiRail requested that should the Board report its decisions on the proposals to the Minister for Land Information, that the Minister for Transport also be informed so that they may advocate for the names as first proposed by KiwiRail. Or alternatively, that a recommendation could be included in the report that the Minister for Land Information consult with the Minister for Transport. The Board Chairperson agreed to the alternative and KiwiRail were advised a recommendation would be included to the Minister, encouraging him to consult with the Minister of Transport.

#### Secretariat recommendation

#### At its 2 December 2022 hui the Board resolved the recommendation.

Consider the 112 submissions from 70 submitters:

and

**Reject** the **objecting submissions**, including those proposing alternative names, based on the reasons given not outweighing the reasons for originally accepting the proposals being:

- the direct association of Paerātā Railway Station and Drury Railway Station to the populated places they will serve,

- Ngākōroa Railway Station not being currently associated with a populated place, being in a rural location southeast of Runciman (locality); and naming it for a suitable nearby geographic feature that recognises connections to the wider original cultural landscape,
- concerns the initially proposed name Maketuu Railway Station, named for the Te Maketu Stream and Te Maketu Historic Reserve, had little apparent relevance to its location, and may be confusing to travellers and tourists,
- applying standardised orthography under expert orthographic advice from a TTWh licensed translator,
- applying standardised orthography nationwide for consistency in the rail network, ie macrons rather than double vowels as applicable for Māori railway station names,

#### Noting:

- orthographic inconsistency with the existing associated names, Paerata, Ngakoroa Stream but that these names could be approved/amended to include macrons in the future,
- the railway stations do not yet exist,
- the location is not fully confirmed for Ngākōroa Railway Station,
- the railway stations are intended to serve new urban developments around them, and names for those areas may eventually differ,
- the former Drury Railway Station and Paerata Station, in the same general locations as the new proposals, were closed in 1972 and 1982 respectively.

**Confirm** the Board's earlier decisions to accept proposals to assign **Paerātā Railway Station**, **Ngākōroa Railway Station** and **Drury Railway Station** as new official railway station names

and

**Report** the Board's decision to the Minister for Land Information, including a recommendation to seek the views of the Minister of Transport **and request** the Minister for Land Information to make the final determinations on the proposals.

### Background

DRAFT Board minutes 26 July 2022 [abridged] A hui with the Mana Whenua Forum was held on 25 May 2022. The Board's orthographic expert spoke about established rules around writing macrons for denoting long vowels, acknowledging that the topic of a written style using double vowels was to be expected in this area. The Board noted that all the reasons for using macrons in terms of te reo Māori standardisation and revitalisation, and the Mana Whenua Forum's reasons for double vowels had been discussed at the hui. The Board considered that while the use of double vowels had been referred to as a 'mita', they are not a dialectal feature. Both macrons and double vowels are intended (in this use) to represent the same way of pronouncing a word, therefore they are a written convention. The Board noted the use of double vowels had long historical roots. Typewriters didn't have macrons so writers such as Pei Te Hurinui Jones<sup>1</sup> used double vowels, although in his handwriting he used macrons. Over time the typewritten use of double vowels transformed into a common practice. The Board noted that double vowels are in fact applied in Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori's orthographic guidelines only for specific reasons such as when words are compounded. However, the proposed names are not compound words. The Board

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ngāti Maniapoto iwi, a former Board member 1938-1976

agreed that ultimately any groups with an interest or further views can make a submission during the public notification period.

The Board considered the relationships between the proposed names and their role in providing a service to populated places they serve. The proposed Maketuu Railway Station would serve Drury, but the proposed name relates to features more than 3km southeast of Drury. The Board discussed the wider relationship between the new railway stations and urban development – that while the railway stations are planned to service anticipated future suburban development, they will also help encourage it. The Board agreed that the proposed Paeraataa Railway Station was broadly appropriate noting that a development being marketed as Paerata Rise is well advanced. The Board noted that the proposed Ngaakooroa Railway Station is near Ngakoroa Stream and agreed that a similar principle of association could apply. The Board noted that Runciman is the nearest named locality to the station and a substantial development already underway nearby is being marketed as Auranga.

The Board agreed to proceed with the recommendations, which would uphold the orthographic conventions created by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori.

#### Notification

Mana whenua	The representatives of the six groups forming KiwiRail's Mana Whenua Forum were advised that consultation would open for three months from 9 August 2022 to 9 November 2022:		
	Ngāti Tamaoho	Ngāti Te Ata Waiohua	Te Ākitai Waiohua
	Ngāi Tai ki Tāmaki	Ngāti Maru	Ngāti Whanaunga
	Ngāti Pāoa, Ngāti Tamater Forum, were also advised c	ā, and Waikato-Tainui, who lirectly.	were not part of the
	Ngāti Whānaunga advised their disappointment regarding the Board's decisions, considering them 'Out of touch and clueless in shaping and influencing social change. Fraught and rigid in thinking; in protection of the status quo.'		
Advice to MPs	The MPs for Papakura, Port Waikato, Hauraki-Waikato, and all adjacent electorate MPs were advised that the proposals were open for submissions until 9 November 2022.		
Public notification including social media	Papakura Courier - on the Toitū Te When		acebook™ pages,
Other notification	KiwiRail, AT, and Auckland links to the Board's propos proposed names with the o	als. Their webpages are stil	nave provided notification / I using the initially
	On 23 November 2022 new railway stations opened, w names Drury Central and P	hich have reverted to using	osed designs for two of the the earlier provisional

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> <u>https://www.kiwirail.co.nz/our-network/our-regions/amp/drury-rail-stations/</u> - last accessed 24 November 2022

On 9 August 2022 the Board published a bilingual media release for the three proposed names. This was also <u>posted on the Toitū Te Whenua LINZ website</u>. <u>Scoop.co.nz</u> syndicated the release the same following day.

There was some media coverage of the three proposed names, noting the changes to the names originally proposed by KiwiRail and AT:

- Public feedback sought on names for three new South Auckland train stations<sup>3</sup>,
- Drury trumps Māori name for railway station<sup>4</sup>.
- Diesel trains retired after 30 years of hard service [just a note]<sup>5</sup>.

Waatea News interviewed the Secretary of the Board live on 11 August 2022.<sup>6</sup>

#### **Submissions**

Summary

Local

engagement

During the notification period from 9 August 2022 to 9 November 2022 the Board received 112 submissions from 70 unique submitters:

Proposed name	Supporting	Objecting	Neutral/unclear
Drury Railway Station	59	4	1
Ngākōroa Railway Station	5	22	1
Paerātā Railway Station	14	5	1

Submissions are categorised below by theme, with similar themes grouped together. Some reasons in the objections are commented on by the Secretariat.

Submissions are summarised separately for each proposal. While some reasons supporting or objecting to the proposed names are common to all four proposals, others are specific to each proposed name.

Full copies of all submissions are in the supporting information together with a combined summary spreadsheet.

This table has the location of all submitters based on volunteered information:

	Pukekohe to Papakura	'Auckland', rest of Auckland	Rest of New Zealand	International	Unknown
#	38	25	4	1	2

This information is collected to inform on the level of local community engagement. It does not indicate that they have a greater influence on the outcome of the proposals. The locations indicate the proposals are of local interest, and of interest more broadly in the region. But the overall response is not high given the potential number of future users of the railway stations.

Affiliation field The online submission form includes a voluntary option for 'affiliation' for the Board's reference. Half the submitters filled in the affiliation field, and emphasise local and long term residence and being involved in the local community. Full information on affiliation is available in each submission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Public feedback sought on names for three new South Auckland train stations, Radio New Zealand, 9 August 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Drury trumps Māori name for railway station Waatea News, 10 August 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> <u>Diesel trains retired after 30 years of hard service</u>, *Today FM*, 12 August 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> https://waateanews.com/2022/08/11/wendy-shaw-the-new-zealand-geographic-board-secretary/ - last accessed 17 November 2022

Issues/notes One submission ticking 'I support' for Drury Railway Station must be counted as an objection because they propose an alternative dual name.

Two submissions 'supported Papakura Railway Station' rather than the proposed Paerātā Railway Station), which is not under consultation. These have not been counted as submissions supporting Paerātā Railway Station.

One submission for all three proposals is considered as neutral/unclear, writing '*I think each station should be named by Destination and Te Reo pleasing all parties*.'. They could be supporting the original proposals from KiwiRail and AT, or the names proposed by the Board, or may be suggesting alternative names acceptable to all stakeholders should be found, etc. Clarification was requested but not received.

#### Submissions for Paerātā Railway Station (new name)

#### Supporting submissions (14)

Reasons categorised, grouped, and summarised	<b>No</b> . <sup>7</sup>
The name is connected to the place, appropriate to name for the existing town/locality. It's the logical name. Will aid travellers and tourists. All railway stations should be named for the populated place.	12
Supports use of macrons over double vowels. It will support correct pronunciation of the name. It's familiar. It's logical. Nationwide consistency across the rail network is important.	4
Double vowels are a local tradition is false/there's no evidence.	1
Historical use of the name for the former Paerata Railway Station [noting this was further to the south]	2
Supports te reo Māori names, generally.	1
Will support development in the area, noting the name is also connected to the Paerata Rise development.	1
Supports standardised generic term [noting initial proposals were in the form 'Railway Station']	1

#### **Objecting submissions (5)**

Reasons categorised, grouped, and summarised	No.
Alternative name proposal: Paeraataa Railway Station	3
Secretariat comment: these three objecting submissions were from KiwiRail & AT, Waka Kotahi and Grimshaw.	
The names gifted by the mana whenua forum should be used.	3
The Board should follow principles of tino rangatiratanga (ie Māori self- determination), specifically.	
Secretariat note: these three objecting submissions were from KiwiRail & AT, Waka Kotahi and Grimshaw, noting the same (or similar) reasons are repeated under each submission's heading.	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Noting that submitters general gave more than one reason.

Supports use of double vowels instead of macrons, based on preference of local iwi, spelling to be used should be determined locally. It would be respectful. Disagree with standardising.	3
Secretariat comment: these 3 objecting submissions were from KiwiRail & AT, Waka Kotahi and Grimshaw.	
Double vowels will aid correct pronunciation.	1
Secretariat comment: the Board considered the reasons for the names originally proposed by KiwiRail and AT at length at its 26 July 2022 hui, noting two additional submissions supporting those reasons.	
There are precedents for use of double vowel spellings. It would be consistent with names of Tribal Authorities, use by local government.	1
The name Paeraataa is connected to the location of the station, in relation to the Burtt Road ridgeline and 'Te Maunu-a-Tuu Paa (Paeraata Bluff Ridge Paa),' to the wider Māori cultural landscape including a history of resource use.	3
Secretariat comment: this is also true of the proposed name, noting the official name of the bluff feature is Te Māunu a Tū Bluff, which is required to be used in all official documents.	
The name should embody Treaty partnership with the Crown	1
Orthography inconsistent with locality name, should be Paerata Railway Station.	1
Should be an English name [unspecified]	1
Name doesn't reflect multicultural population	1

# Submissions for Ngākōroa Railway Station (new name)

# Supporting submissions (5)

Reasons categorised, grouped, and summarised	No.
The name is connected to the stream name, appropriate for the railway station.	4
The proposed name is appropriately connected to the new Ngākōroa School.	1
Supports use of macrons over double vowels. It will support correct pronunciation of the name. It's familiar. It's logical. Nationwide consistency across the rail network is important.	2
Supports standardising the generic terms [noting the original proposals were already standardised as 'Railway Station'].	1
That double vowels are a local tradition is false/there's no evidence/there's no justification.	1
Notes the name Auranga for the development to the north would not be appropriate; Auranga might be considered a suburb of the future urban landscape around the station.	2
The name will support the future development in the area; could call development around the station Ngākōroa (or it may end up called that inevitably).	1

Still supports but might have preferred Runciman.	n.
---	----

# **Objecting submissions (22)**

Reasons categorised, grouped, and summarised	No.
Proposed name not relevant. Even locals aren't familiar with the name of the small creek. Should be named for a populated place.	13
Alternative name proposal: <b>Runciman</b> (logical, obvious, what people call the area, there was a former station of the same name).	10
Secretariat comment: at its 26 July 2022 hui the Board noted Runciman was the nearest locality name recorded in the Gazetteer.	
Other alternative name proposals:	8
- Drury South (1), Drury West (1)	
- Karaka (2)	
<ul> <li>Ngākōroa-Runciman (1)</li> <li>Paerata Rise (1)</li> </ul>	
- Ramarama (1)	
- an English name [unspecified] (1)	
Secretariat comment: the objecting submissions proposing Karaka as an alternative name consider it has some rail heritage value, as there was a 'Karaka Railway Siding' in the vicinity.	
Objects, but no alternative specified.	1
Alternative name proposal: Ngaakooroa Railway Station	3
Secretariat comment: these 3 objecting submissions were from KiwiRail & AT, Waka Kotahi and Grimshaw.	
The name Ngaakooroa is connected to the location of the station, in relation to the tidal creek, to the wider Māori cultural landscape including a history of resource use in the area.	3
The names gifted by the mana whenua forum should be used. The Board should follow principles of tino rangatiratanga (ie Māori self determination), specifically.	3
Supports use of double vowels instead of macrons, based on preference of local iwi, spelling to be used should be determined locally. It would be respectful. Disagree with standardising.	3
Double vowels will aid correct pronunciation.	1
There are precedents for use of double vowel spellings. It would be consistent with names of Tribal Authorities, use by local government.	1
Ngaakooroa is particularly appropriate as the associated geographic feature was used historically for transportation.	1
Secretariat comment: this is true of the proposed name.	
The name should embody Treaty partnership with the Crown	1
Need to put more extensive thought into the name - the railway station will by default define the name of the surrounding developments.	1
Secretariat comment: the Board noted the strong relationship between the names of railway stations and the development of populated places.	

1

Notes the name Auranga for the development to the north would not be appropriate; Auranga would be a suburb of the future urban landscape around the station.	1
Proposed name doesn't reflect multicultural population.	1

# Submissions for Drury Railway Station (new name)

### Supporting submissions (59)

Reasons categorised, grouped, and summarised	No.
The proposed name is connected to the place, it's appropriate to name for the existing town/locality. It's the logical name. Will aid travellers and tourists. All railway stations should be named for the populated place.	38
The name Drury is historic. It's at the location and was the name of the former railway station.	24
Long term use/would object to changing the name [noting there is no current railway station, so no existing name].	
The name is relevant, loved, resonates, important to the people. Other names would be disrespectful to the people.	8
Maketu, Te Maketū, etc is inappropriate as the associated features are much too far away, will be confusing.	6
Maketu is duplicated in the Bay of Plenty.	
Would be more costly in advertising to try and ensure people know where the station actually is.	
The name is distinct, unique.	2
General comments. States support without any specific reasons.	5
Secretariat comment: All submissions require reasons in terms of the NZGB Act 2008 whether supporting or objecting.	
Concerned about 'Māorification' and 'balance' (ie, there's no need for all three names to be Māori as initially proposed), a Māori name would be tokenism.	3
Supports an English name in general.	2
The name will support the future development in the area.	3
The name reflects the multicultural society.	1
Comments about where the railway station should be located.	1
Secretariat comment: As noted in the proposal report, the physical location of the railway stations have been determined and it's the Board's role to decide on the most appropriate names.	
Supports standardising the generic terms [noting the initial proposals were already standardised as 'Railway Station'].	1
Notwithstanding that the Te Maketū names are distant, there's no reason the physical station design couldn't still be influenced by the name or stories relating to other Māori names and history in the area.	1

#### **Objecting submissions (4)**

Reasons categorised, grouped, and summarised	No
Alternative name proposal: [Te] Maketuu Railway Station	3
Secretariat comment: these 3 objecting submissions were from KiwiRail & AT, Waka Kotahi and Grimshaw.	
The names gifted by the mana whenua forum should be used. The Board should follow principles of tino rangatiratanga (ie Māori self determination), specifically.	3
Supports use of double vowels instead of macrons, based on preference of local iwi, spelling to be used should be determined locally. It would be respectful. Disagree with standardising.	3
Maketuu would connect to a Māori cultural history in the landscape, including resource use. Specifically, the railway station would connect to 'Maketuu Stream, Maketuu Waterfalls, Te Maketuu Paa'.	3
Double vowels will aid correct pronunciation.	1
There are precedents for use of double vowel spellings. It would be consistent with names of Tribal Authorities, use by local government.	1
The name should embody Treaty partnership with the Crown.	1
The railway station is considered to be separate from Drury (locality) and will serve a broader region and new community of Maketuu.	1
Secretariat comment: the Board considered that the proposed Drury Railway Station being on the footprint of the former Drury Railway Station, at the south of Drury (locality) would likely have strong associations with Drury (locality).	
Planned developments around the railway station may eclipse the current Drury in size and scale. The Board would encourage proposing names for new towns and suburbs through the statutory process and making them official.	
It is unclear if the name Maketuu is used as a populated place name in the wider area.	
Alternative name proposal: a dual name (preferences to order, orthography unspecified).	1

#### Supporting information

- 1. Board Proposal Report Paeraataa Railway Station, Ngaakooroa Railway Station, Maketuu Railway Station 2022-07-26
- 2. Combined submission summary spreadsheet south Auckland railway stations
- 3. Unedited copy of online Qualtrics platform submissions output
- 4. Copies of supporting submissions not received through online Qualtrics platform
- 5. Copies of objecting submissions not received through online Qualtrics platform
- 6. Copy of 'neutral' (unclear) submission for all three proposals not received through online Qualtrics platform
- 7. Waatea News interview with Secretary of the NZGB.