

Place Names Summary Report

For NZGB Meeting on 3 August 2010

- (1) **Alternative Māori Names for the North and South Islands** *(restoring)*
(2) **North Island and South Island** *(make official)*

General Background

What has the Board Agreed in Principle to Date?

On **9 November 2007** the Board formally considered the proposal to change the name of the South Island to Te Wai Pounamu and decided:

- to accept, in principle, the assignment of original Māori names for the North and South Islands;
- Māori names for both the North and South Islands need to be considered at the same time;
- any Māori names for the North and South Islands should be classified as alternative names, meaning that both of the current names or the Māori names could continue to be used either separately or together;
- to investigate what the alternative Māori names are by holding a national hui with Māori; and
- to implement a coordinated communications strategy to ensure public awareness of the proposals.

At its teleconference of **15 January 2008**, the Board:

- noted that the names "North Island" and "South Island" have never been formally gazetted and therefore are not official names;
- decided, in principle, that these names should be formalised at the same time as the Māori names.

On **7 April 2008** the Board discussed this matter again including the then Minister's suggestions:

- to possibly process the proposal for the South Island separately and before the North Island, if the Board agrees;
- that the North Island is considered to be much more controversial – with many more iwi and a larger population; and
- there are budget constraints in this financial year to cover full consultation requirements for the North Island.

Despite the Minister's suggestion, the Board confirmed that it would proceed to process both names together, because they are a pair and New Zealanders will expect them to be processed together. The Board also believed this would be more cost effective and efficient. In terms of timing, the Board noted LINZ's resourcing constraints and other priorities for the remainder of 2008, and felt that 2009 would provide a better opportunity for debate, and would also allow more flexible public consultation under the new Act.

On **27 March 2009** the Board noted fiscal constraints resulting from the global economic downturn and decided to consult with iwi by correspondence rather than by means of a face to face hui, in order to reduce costs. The Board also noted the likelihood that the proposals would become public knowledge soon after writing to iwi and therefore resolved that the mailout of letters to iwi should be immediately preceded by a media release informing the public of the proposal, the decisions already made and the next steps. The Board was of the view that it did not wish to delay the statutory process any further, being conscious of the significant delays to date.

The Board decided that one potential original Māori name for the North Island, Aotearoa, would not be appropriate because of its common usage as the Māori name for New Zealand. However, the Board acknowledged that Aotearoa for the North Island will continue in oral tradition and informal use by many iwi.

On **16 September 2009** the Board did not consider these names because it was still awaiting iwi responses, who had a deadline of the end of 2009, and the Board therefore deferred to the first Board meeting in 2010.

Consultation with Iwi

The Board believes that tangata whenua Māori have the best repository of knowledge about traditional Māori names.

The Board has a function to collect original Māori place names and encourage their use on maps and charts. There are several different known Māori names for each island. The Board had agreed to approach iwi to seek known traditional Māori names for both islands, and their associated stories, so that the Board can then determine which is the most appropriate name for each island, before seeking views from the New Zealand public.

As the original proposal related specifically to the South Island, the Board has already asked South Island iwi about any known Māori names for that island – see details under heading below *‘Outcome of the Hui with South Island Iwi in September 2007’*. The views of South Island iwi were also being sought further.

A circular letter was mailed on 18 June 2009 to 143 iwi organisations, together with an information document, factsheet, brochure and process flowchart. The address source was from TPK’s online listing of iwi authorities. As at early August 2009, very few responses had been received. A reminder was sent on 10 November 2009.

Iwi Responses

NO.	DATE	NAME OF RESPONDENT	NORTH ISLAND NAME	SOUTH ISLAND NAME
1	7/07/09	Te Rūnanga-a-iwi o Ngāti Kahu	Te Ika Ā Māui	To be named by South Island hapu who hold mana whenua and mana moana
2	22/07/09	Ngāti Mutunga o Wharekauri Iwi Trust	Acknowledged NZGB letter and advised of a response before the end of the year	
3	23/09/09	Tanenuiārangi o Manawatu Inc	Te Ika a Maui	Te Waipounamu (incorrectly spelt Te Waipounanu)
4	13/10/09	Ngāti Hei o Hauraki	Te Aheinomouwe (phonetic) Te Ahi no Maui (correct orthography)	Te Wai Pounamu
5	20/11/09	Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Te Rangi Iwi Trust	Te Ika a Maui	-
6	30/11/09	Te Atiawa ki te Upoko o te Ika a Maui Potiki Trust	Te Ika a Maui (preferred) or Aotearoa (alternatively)	Te Wai Pounamu (preferred) Te Waka a Maui noted as the pairing to Te Ika a Maui, but considers that the most usual forms should used
7	4/12/09	Ngāi Tamaoho	Acknowledged NZGB letter advised of a response in due course	
8	1/12/09	Te Rūnanga o Ngāti Kahu (ki Tauranga) Inc.	Te Ika-a-Maui	Te Tai Tonga
9	15/12/09	Te Rūnanga o Ngāti Whātua	Te Ika-ā-Māui	Te Waipounamu or Te Waka ā Māui
10	28/01/09	Ngāti Tuwharetoa (BOP) Settlement Trust	Seeks Aotearoa as one name for both islands.	

This is a disappointing response from iwi, and possibly highlights the need for this type of consultation to be undertaken directly with iwi, face to face, rather than by letter, notwithstanding the need to reduce costs for government. The requirement for more effective consultation with iwi was raised through the review of the Act – that iwi seek to be consulted with directly by the Board.

These few iwi responses show a variety of views, though there appears to be relatively consistent support for Te Ika a Maui (orthography and spelling need to be confirmed).

Te Wai Pounamu also appears to have common support (again the orthography and spelling need to be confirmed).

Outcome of the Hui with South Island Iwi in September 2007:

- 6/11/2007: Letter from Ngāi Tahu advising of several known Māori names for the South Island. General agreement that the proposal from the original proposer was not supported, but rather South Island iwi would work together and advise the Board at a more suitable time.
- 20/08/2007: Email from Rangitane advising that Te Waipounamu is a name synonymous with the South Island and as such would be supported by Rangitane. Living in Te Tau Ihu o te waka a Maui, we would find it difficult to support Te waka o Aoraki.
- 28/09/2007: Letter from Ngāti Kuia opposing the application from the original proposer, but supports a joint iwi application supporting a dual name 'Te Waipounamu / South Island', with the Māori name first.

Consultation with the General Public of New Zealand:

Anyone can write to the Board at any time, however, the formal consultation with all New Zealanders has not begun, as known traditional Māori names for the North Island and South Island have first been sought from iwi.

The Board recognises the interest New Zealanders are likely to have in the Māori names for the North and South Islands. The Board will therefore ensure a sufficient period of time to enable robust public debate and allow individuals an opportunity to express their views. Public consultation is not likely to start until the NZGB Act 2008 is amended to allow for alternative naming – see details below under heading '*Progress of the Amendment to the 2008 Act*'.

An online submission form has been set up by LINZ specifically for the significant volume of responses expected from the general public (as was done for the Whanganui proposal).

Progress of the Amendment to the 2008 Act:

LINZ Policy sought to process the change through the non-controversial Statutes Amendment Bill (SAB). However, agreement by one political party was not able to be obtained (as advised to the Secretariat on 25 May 2010). Therefore the change will have to progress through a full Amendment to the NZGB Act 2008, which is a much lengthier process, and may not be effected until early 2011.

Therefore, because the 2008 Act will not be amended in time for the Board's 3 August meeting, then in terms of process, it would not be recommended for the Board to proceed with alternative names, if it does not have the statutory power to do so. However, any decisions made by the Board on 3 August 2010 could be held off from public notification until the amendment comes into force.

The proposed amendment (draft) is:

104A Principal Act amended

This Part amends the New Zealand Geographic Board (Ngā Pou Taunaha o Aotearoa) Act 2008.

104B Interpretation

(1) Section 4 is amended by inserting the following definition in its appropriate alphabetical order:

"alternative official geographic names means any 2 or more alternative official geographic names assigned for the same geographic feature [Q: or concurred for the same Crown protected area?]".

(2) Paragraph (a)(i) of the definition of official geographic name in section 4 is amended by omitting "by the Board" and substituting "under this Act".

(3) Paragraph (b) of the definition of official geographic name in section 4 is amended by adding "; and" and also by adding the following subparagraph:

"(iv) alternative official geographic names".

104C Official geographic names must be used

Section 32 is amended by inserting the following subsection after subsection (1):

"(1A) If 2 or more alternative official geographic names exist for the same geographic feature or Crown protected area, the use of any 1 of those names is sufficient to comply with subsection (1)."

Why not Dual Names?:

In this case, the Board decided that changed names or dual names would cause too much cost and disruption throughout the whole country and for visitors to New Zealand. Therefore a decision in principle has been made to assign the Māori names as alternatives to the English names, North Island and South Island, thereby preserving New Zealand's heritage in both languages. The general public could still seek to assign dual names during the public consultation phase, which is not likely to start until later in 2010 at the earliest. However to do this, the Board would need good reasons and evidence of significant public support for other proposals. The Board currently believes that alternative naming would be the best, least disruptive, and least costly option.

Advice to the Minister:

- No weekly Status Report from LINZ has yet advised the Minister about the possibility of the Board making a decision at its meeting on 3 August 2010, subject to the amended Act coming into effect.

Ministerial Correspondence:

- To the original proposer dated 10 February 2010, re Aotearoa and the Board's jurisdiction.

Recent Correspondence from the Submitter:

- Dated 23 September 2009: Demystifying 'The Great New Zealand Myth'.
- Copies of all papers received from the submitter are copied again for all Board members, particularly the new Board members.

Correspondence from the General Public after Media Release of April 2009:

- *Wilkie, 22/04/2009:* Advice that Māori had no written language, so oral tradition and carvings are the means of remembering matters of significance. "After Maui reached Kaikoura in Mahunui he was standing on a hill on the peninsula called Te Taumanu-a-Maui. While Maui was staring all about, he happened to look northwards and in the distance saw something in the water. Casting his line and hook, Maui first caught, and then fished up the North Island (Te Ika-a-Maui). As far as Ngai Tahu Mamoe Fisher people are concerned, the ancient names for the South Island are: Mahunui and Te Waka-Maui, not Te Wai Pounamu. Te Wai Pounamu is a Johnny come lately name, and evolved via Polynesian occupation at a much later date."

- *Lincolne*, 24/04/2009: Advice of Dumont D'Urville's account which records Ahi-no Mawi (fire of the first man) and Tavai Pounamou (jade water). Also considers that gaps in early knowledge have been plugged with inventive mythical hearsay.
- *Woodford*, 23 April 2009: Seeks that the names for the North and South Island be made official immediately and any other names can be discussed and considered in a proper timeframe.
- *Connolly*, 24/04/2009: Has a general concern about the escalating changes to place names (citing Taranaki, Egmont, Aoraki and Cook). Expressed concern about the media coverage and doesn't mind whether Maori or English, so long as one name is used.
- *Huirana*, 1/05/2009: Advises "a) The South Island of New Zealand is known as Te-Waaka-A-Maui. Named by the sovereign MauiTikiTikiATaranga. This name defines the correct definition for the South Island; b) The name Waipounamu refers to the green stone rivers of the South Island, Wai-waters and pounamu-greenstone. No ancient Native Māori called the entire South Island Waipounamu, the name referred to greenstone rivers and should always remain so."
- *Wanoa*, 11/05/2009: Advises that the Moriori Atua name for the North Island is 'Raki', and for the South Island is 'Aoraki'.
- *Thomas*, 17/05/2009: Thinks that there is no original Māori word for the South Island. Advises that the North Island was Ao Tea Roa, a named that is now commonly used for New Zealand, but not official so could be reversed. Discusses that Nu Tirani is in the Treaty of Waitangi, whilst Ao Tea Roa was not once referred to. The original names for the main islands were replaced a long time ago by the present versions, which are requested to be retained.
- *Hall*, 5/06/2009: Notes an old map showing Tavai-Poenamoo for the South Island and Mahai-Nomai for the North Island.

Communication Plan:

- The Communications Plan has been requested to be updated as at July 2010 (LINZ Strategic Communications responsibility). Once updated, a copy will be tabled at the meeting on 3 August 2010.

Media:

- Very little since the Board's last meeting of 16 September 2009.

Possible Issues:

- the proposal goes public too soon and the Board looks unprepared and secretive;
- iwi feel pushed into the debate;
- iwi are unable to agree on the most appropriate names for the islands;
- iwi feel that correspondence is not an appropriate way to determine a matter of this importance and seek a national hui or series of hui;
- LINZ is not resourced to conduct national hui;
- general public feel disadvantaged where iwi have been consulted directly first;
- communication channels do not reach enough people;
- the Board comes across as bureaucratic and the media attention focuses on processes, not the issue;
- negative public relations for the department and Minister;
- Government is thought to be holding back from going public because of the controversy expected; and
- The Board has been proceeding with this proposal since 2004. It has been gathering information in order to be able to properly consult with the public. However, it could be perceived that government does not wish to consider the views of the public.

North Island and South Island

These names date back to the common spoken qualifying/directional usage applied since early British/European settlement. The following documents refer:

- British Proclamation of Sovereignty, May 1840 – refers to ‘The Middle Island’ and ‘The Northern Island’ (and ‘Stewart’s Island’)
- Proclamation, May/June/July 1841 – designates the Northern Island as ‘New Ulster’, and the Southern Island as ‘New Munster’ (and Stewart’s Island as ‘New Leinster’). Note that Hobson, as instructed to Shortland, had intended to use the native names of the islands (as they had appeared on Cook’s chart), but could not remember them, so they were left blank in the proclamation, and later Colenso chose to use the English names for the two main islands, possibly because of urgency or administrative confusion at the time.

Refer to:

- correspondence of 28 April 2009 and attachments from Dr Phil Parkinson, Alexander Turnbull Library. Dr Parkinson came to the conclusion that no formal naming of North Island and South Island exists.
- the listings of historic/obsolete maps that record North Island and South Island, as well as some that recorded ‘(Te Ika-a-Maui)’ and ‘(Te Wai-Pounamu)’ after North Island and South Island.
- The ‘information for iwi’ document that was distributed with the June 2009 letter, which lists other examples of recorded names for both islands.

The submitter had advised that by instruction from the Minister of Lands in 1907, a direction was given that the names for the North Island and South Island should be used. No evidence of this has been able to be found of this directive, though Reed’s Dictionary of NZ Place Names also refer to the instruction. Board member Professor Michael Roche began researching at Archives NZ for this missing instruction, but no documents have come to light. However, it is clear that maps and charts began to use only these names from the early 1900s, some with ‘(Te Ika-a-Maui)’ and ‘(Te Wai-Pounamu)’ after North Island and South Island (as mentioned above), but that from around the 1950s the Māori names ceased to be used. The Board is not aware of any documented decision for this.

The Definite Article

The question of the use of the definite article before North Island and South Island should be considered. Common spoken usage appears to include the prefix, but maps, charts and other official documents drop the ‘The’. In the suggested Māori alternatives ‘Te’ (the, singular) is used in Te Wai Pounamu and Te Ika a Maui. But the comparison is not a significant argument to warrant applying the definite article to the English words.

New Zealand has no formal written policy on the use of the definite article. It is briefly referenced in the Frameworks document under Capitalisation, which states: “All word parts of an official geographic name should normally have a capital, including adjectives, common nouns, and the definite article.”

Long term and common usage, as well as euphony, guide the Board in its decision-making on whether to include ‘The’ or not, for new proposals. A recent example refers: ‘The Catlins’. New Zealand has just over 154 official geographic names using ‘The’, but there are many more unofficial names of this type that are recorded/collected/depicted on official maps and charts.

In terms of Māori language names, the use is widespread, with ‘Te’ (singular) and ‘Ngā’ (plural). And these are sometimes compounded with the specific and generic parts of the name. Again the application is determined by local usage (by iwi) but orthography conventions developed by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori (the Māori Language Commission) are taken into account by the Board.

Andersen’s and Reed’s Card Indexes

Refer to these significant entries of the 1930s-1940s, provided by the Alexander Turnbull Library (photocopying permitted for Board members only). Of note:

- Johannes Carl Andersen considered that Te Wai-pounamu should be restricted for the district north of Lake Wakatipu, as Cook and others indicated, and its spelling should be corrected to Te Wahi-pounamu (the place of greenstone).
- Johannes Carl Andersen records that Te Ika a Maui is the ancient name, but also possibly known as He ahi no Maui.

These card indexes are a significant resource, which the Board is encouraged to refer to.

Recorded Māori Names:

Some of the South Island names that have come to the Board's attention include:

- | | |
|---------------------|---|
| • Te Tumuki | the oldest recorded name |
| • Te Arapaoa | Kupe's blow killing a taniwha |
| • Tovypoenammu | Captain Cook's spelling of Te Wai Pounamu |
| • Te Wai Pounamu | the water/place of greenstone |
| • Te Wāhi Pounamu | the place of greenstone |
| • Te Moana Pounamu | the water in which the greenstone dwelt |
| • Te Waka a Maui | the canoe of Maui |
| • Te Waka o Aoraki | the canoe of Aoraki |
| • Tau Ihu o te Waka | top of the canoe |
| • Mahunui | name of the canoe of Maui |

Some North Island Māori names include:

- | | |
|---------------------|---|
| • Te Ika a Maui | the fish of Maui |
| • Aotearoa | land of the long white cloud |
| • Nuku-roa | far stretching land |
| • Aeheinomouwe | Captain Cook's spelling |
| • He Ahi No Maui | a fire of Maui (Cook's name correctly spelt?) |
| • He Mea Hi No Maui | a thing fished from the sea by Maui (Cook?) |

Charts and maps of early explorers showed the following Māori names recorded for both islands:

- Eahei No Mauwe for the North Island and T'avai Poenammoo for the South Island (Cook 1769–1770)
- Eaheinomauwe for the North Island and Tavai Poenammoo for the South Island (Arrowsmith 1841)
- Te-ahi a Maui for the North Island and Te Wai Pounamu for the South Island (Stokes 1848–1855).

Refer to copies of some of these old maps and charts to be tabled at the Board's meeting on 3 August 2010.

Recorded English Names:

There have been several other known recorded English names for both islands:

- Middle Island – for the South Island, in the group North Island, Middle Island and South Island, where South Island applied to Stewart Island / Rakiura
- New Ulster – for the North Island
- New Munster – for the South Island
- Island of Victoria – for the South Island.

Archive Records held by the Board:

Refer to copies of Board card indexes and relevant archive records.

Other Comments:

- There are no duplication issues with any of the variant English or Māori names.
- Published usage of Te Wai Pounamu and Te Ika a Maui on maps and charts had been consistent up to the 1950s.

- Orthography and spelling is to be advised by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori (the Māori Language Commission), as per Section 11(1)(f) of the NZGB Act 2008.
- The Board to consider implications for agencies dealing with emergency response or navigation on land and sea – the impacts, risks, and need for education. Even though the names are proposed to be alternatives, there may be some risk of people using the not-so-common Māori names, potentially creating confusion.
- The Board to also consider the costs associated when both alternative names are used. It would generally be noted that any changes could occur with routine maintenance updates, so as not to incur significant additional costs. As alternative names, there will be no expectation that one or other or both must be used in official documents, or by anyone else. The whole point of alternative naming is that any of the names can be used individually or together.
- However, there may be an expectation that government agencies would be encouraged to use both sets of alternative names, where appropriate and applicable.
- The implications for the name of New Zealand is not within the Board's jurisdiction – Section 8(3) of the NZGB Act 2008 refers.

Conclusion:

The traditional and older pairing of Te Waka a Maui and Te Ika a Maui may, to some extent, lose some of its importance in history if Te Wai Pounamu were to be accepted for the South Island. Similarly, the pairing from Ngāi Tahu's perspective of Te Wai Pounamu and Aotearoa has the potential to be lost or watered down. However, oral tradition and informal use by many iwi would likely continue for both of these pairings. It is also noted that Stewart Island is now officially Stewart Island / Rakiura, using the Ngāi Tahu name and not the Maui traditional name, Te Punga/Puka a Maui (the anchor of Maui). So the connection between the three traditional Maui names for the islands is already severed.

Despite these pairing concerns, the more recent and widespread usage, and apparent acceptance of Te Ika a Maui and Te Wai Pounamu, would appear to be preferred by iwi, based on the small level of feedback received to date. The public consultation will attract further and a more significant number of views and these can be taken into account by the Board after the submission deadline has passed (possibly in November/December 2010). It is expected that there will be objections and that the Board may not uphold any or all of those objections, and so the Minister for Land Information will be required to make the final determinations.